arXiv:hep-th/9209132v1 30 Sep 1992

Comment on "Internal Frame Dragging and a Global Analog of the Aharonov-Bohm Effect"

by

C. R. Hagen

Department of Physics and Astronomy

University of Rochester

Rochester, NY 14627

In a recent work[1] it has been claimed that Aharonov-Bohm (AB) scattering[2] can occur for sufficiently low momentum transfers in the presence of a symmetry breaking vortex configuration. According to the argument given there crucial elements for the occurrence of this effect are the existence of two degrees of freedom as well as an angular dependence ("internal frame dragging") of the symmetry breaking term. This note will point out, however, that neither of these is essential to obtaining an AB form for the scattering cross section in the forward direction and that the effect is rather a consequence of the extreme long range behavior of the symmetry breaking term. In the examples considered[1] – both in the scalar and spinor cases – infinite energy configurations are required to generate the AB result.

The symmetry breaking effect in ref. 1 invokes a scalar field, which is taken to have expectation value $ve^{i\phi}$ outside a core region. Since the λ field contributes an amount $|\partial\lambda|^2$ to the energy of the system, it is straightforward to obtain the result that at large r it gives a logarithmically divergent contribution to the energy. If one elects to cut off the large r behavior, this divergence can be avoided, but the $(1/\sin^2\theta/2)$ form of the cross section in the forward direction is necessarily lost.[3] The result is similar in the spin one-half case. The constant magnitude of the magnetization which is essential to the result is well known[4] to imply logarithmically divergent self energy for an isolated vortex.

On the other hand it is easy to show in specific (finite energy) examples that there exist cases in which neither ϕ dependent symmetry breaking nor multiple degrees of freedom are required to generate the AB cross section. Consider, for example, the model in which $<\lambda>\sim$ const/r for large r. This choice implies a finite ground state energy for the λ field, but at the same time provides an effective potential which has sufficiently long range to imply a divergent forward cross section. This result has in fact been calculated[5] and is known to yield precisely the $(1/\sin^2\theta/2)$ AB form for small scattering angles.

One notable difference between this work and ref. 1 is that in the latter case "an essentially geometrical, parameter-independent form" is obtained for the cross section whereas

the ϕ independent symmetry breaking discussed here implies that it should be proportional to the square of the symmetry breaking parameter. Since, however, physical quantities are frequently found to become parameter independent when certain unphysical limits are taken, it is reasonable to conclude that the parameter independence of the results of ref. 1 is principally a consequence of the infinite energy of the system considered there. In fact it seems that ϕ independent symmetry breaking leads in a much more natural way to AB-like cross sections. In particular, a ϕ dependence appears to inhibit the effect, forcing one to postulate considerably more singular configurations in order to generate the same phenomenon.

Acknowledgments

The author is indebted to S. Teitel for conversations on the XY model and to the D.O.E., Grant No. DE-FG02-91ER40685.

References

1. J. March-Russell, J. Preskill, and F. Wilczek, Phys. Rev. Lett. **68**, 2567 (1992).
2. Y. Aharonov and D. Bohm, Phys. Rev. **115**, 485 (1959).
3. When such a cutoff is used, it may be possible to obtain an AB form of the cross section, if only at intermediate momentun transfers. Even this would require that there exist a nonvanishing range of momentum transfers which are much less than the Γ of ref. 1 but much greater than the square of the inverse cutoff distance. Such a range may or may not exist, depending upon the particular application.
4. M. Plischke and B. Bergensen, Equilibrium Statistical Physics, Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall (1989).
5. J. Law, M. K. Srivastava, R. K. Bhaduri, and A. Khare, J. Phys. A **25**, L183 (1992).